Women's inactivity in the labor market

Factors hindering women's participation in the labor market
Women's inactivity in the labor market

Factors hindering women's participation in the labor market

Prishtina, November 2017
Women's inactivity in the labor market

Copyright © 2017. Democracy for Development (D4D).

All rights reserved. Except for the quotation of short passages for the purposes of criticism and review, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of D4D.

Paper prepared by: Linda Abazi Morina and Rezarta Delibashzade
With contributions by: Ajete Kërqi and Valëza Zogjani

“This research was made possible by Engagement for Equity Program - E4E, financed by United States Agency for International Development - USAID, and supported by Advocacy Training and Resource Center - ATRC. The content of this research is the responsibility of Democracy for Development (D4D) Institute and does not state or reflect the views or opinions of the US Government or USAID.”
Women’s inactivity in the labor market

Contents

Executive Summary 5

Methodology 7

What hinders women’s activity in the labor market? Review of social and cultural factors, policies and laws. 8

Social and cultural factors 8
Policies 8
Legislation 10

Personal and/or family obligations force women to work part-time 11

Survey Results: Why are women not participating in the labor market? 13

Public vs private sector: Which one is more appealing? 14

Disaggregation by gender and age 14
Disaggregation by educational level 15
Disaggregation by income 15
Disaggregation by region 16

Family responsibilities hinder women to search for jobs 18

Disaggregation by ethnicity and age 19

Is discrimination impeding women’s inclusion in the labor market? 20

Disaggregation by age and educational level 20
Disaggregation by ethnicity 20
Disaggregation by employment status 21

Discrimination is affected by societal and cultural norms. 22

Equal treatment in the workplace would motivate women to be active in the labor market 23

Disaggregation by age 23
Disaggregation by ethnicity and employment status 24

Access to affordable childcare and elderly care facilities
Women's inactivity in the labor market

contributes to women’s increase in active labor 25

Disaggregation by educational level 25

Women lack access to tailored job-trainings 27

Disaggregation by education, employment status, income, and region 27

Women are challenged by lack of job opportunities to undertake new responsibilities and be part of decision making in general 28

Findings from the workshops 29

The benefits to the society deriving from active women in the labor market 30

Recommendations 32

For the Government: 32

For Civil Society 34

List of Publications 37

Endnote 41
Executive Summary

This paper aims to identify the reasons why a significant percentage of working age women are inactive in Kosovo’s labor market, and offer remedies. Using first-hand research through surveys, and discussions with key stakeholders, the paper has shed light on the social and cultural factors that hinder women’s engagement in the labor market.

Only one in eight women in Kosovo are either looking for a job or employed\(^1\), and this ranks Kosovo as one of the countries with the lowest women participation rate in Europe\(^2\). Exclusion of women from the workforce is one of the key bottlenecks to the overall development in Kosovo. \(^3\)

The survey, whose details are explained in the methodology, has shown that care responsibilities for children and elderly, and overall lack of employment opportunities are the main issues that hinder women’s inclusion in the labor market. Most of the respondents agree that women are discriminated in the labor market, and more importantly they attribute the socio and cultural factors such as the patriarchal mindset, and provisions of maternity leave, as main variables that contribute to discrimination.

The report serves as a roadmap for policymakers at large as it offers concrete steps that once undertaken unlock the potential, and catalyze the process of development. The policy recommendations that this paper purports based on the findings are improving elderly facilities, providing better and more affordable childcare, tailored made job-training based on needs assessment, incentivizing women owned businesses. Given a political will to work upon these recommendations, concrete results would be shown in our road towards fostering the countries overall development through inclusion of women in the labor market.
The main findings from the survey are as:

- More 53.2% of the respondents claim that the main reason for women’s exclusion of the labor market is that they have care responsibilities for the children and elderly in the family, whilst 30% list lack of employment opportunities as the reason for women exclusion.

- More than half of the respondents (60%) agree that women face discrimination in the process of employment and list patriarchal society (43%) and maternity leave (26%) as the main reasons for the discrimination.

- In terms of incentivizing women to become active in the labor market, around 33% of the respondents think that equal treatment between men and women is the solution, followed by 25% that list equal pay for equal responsibilities as a solution.

When asked whose responsibility should it be when it comes to child care, 44% believe that it should be equally divided between the parents. However, 29% answered that the mother should be solely responsible, and only 3% believe that the father should be responsible solely.
Methodology

The research used for the paper was both quantitative and qualitative. A questionnaire in the form of omnibus was done using a sample of 1,070 respondents (53.1% women, and 46.9% men). The survey covered all seven Kosovo regions, and respondents were from 18-64 of age. The sample was stratified: (i) based on ethnicity, where three non-groups are created, (ii) based on the residence, and (iii) based on the number of surveys implemented in each residence. In each municipality we cover also the urban and rural areas.

Qualitative research was done through a series of public discussions across Kosovo, a consultative meeting, and workshops. The aim of this qualitative research was twofold: (a) to validate our findings from the survey, and (b) offer us a qualitative analysis in regards to the reasons for women’s exclusion from the labor market.

Five (5) Public Discussions were held with at least 20 women participants in each discussion, who were civil society members, entrepreneurs and owners of start-up businesses, public officials, as well as unemployed. Participants were diverse as they were

One consultative meeting was held with civil society organization members, gender equality officials from governmental institutions, think tanks, and researchers.

Four (4) workshops were held in Ferizaj, Prishtina, Peja, and Mitrovica. In total 130 women participants were part of the workshops organized.

As the paper dwells on key concepts of labor economics, for those unfamiliar with the terms, please refer to Appendix A where more details are provided.
What hinders women’s activity in the labor market? Review of social and cultural factors, policies and laws.

Social and cultural factors

Social and cultural factors contribute vastly to the approach in the labor market. Patriarchal societies suffer not only from women exclusion from the labor market, but also from gender discrimination in the workplace, lack of educational opportunities for women, and occupational standards determined by gender. Kosovo’s case, through a numerous studies, discussions, and especially this paper’s findings, confirms the fact that it suffers from a patriarchal mindset which hinders women’s inclusion in the labor market.

In UNDP’s human development report, it is confirmed that women, because of traditional roles as the primary caregiver, are prevented entry into the labor force. Moreover, the study shows that women under 23 years old, married, with no education, and residing in rural areas, are prone to be inactive. Questions about family and personal life in job interviews is very common in the Kosovo labor market. The results from the research show that approximately 54.1% of women respondents were asked about family life and plans to create a family during their job interview.

Policies

Lack of affordable childcare services in Kosovo is also a main contributor to hindering women’s access to the labor market. There are no concrete and impactful steps undertaken in this regard. In 2016, 20.5% of EU-28 women within the age category of 25-54 declared being inactive. In order to address the issue of women’s inactivity, a number of European countries have created a policy provision that
established a legal entitlement to childcare services. For example, in April 2014, Malta introduced a free childcare scheme for children under the age of three to encourage more parents, particularly mothers, to return to or remain in the work force.\(^8\)

Other EU Member States have undertaken several reforms to enhance work-life balance policies with view of increasing labor market participation. For instance, Austria has announced investments totaling EUR 800 million by the year 2018/2019 to increase the number and availability of places in all-day schools, as well as for improving the quality of their services. Furthermore, the United Kingdom has introduced shared parental leave, allowing parents to share 52 weeks of paid leave and pay following the birth or adoption of a child.\(^9\)

In Kosovo the case is very different. Although though women inactivity rates in Kosovo compared to the EU are very high this is yet to see any concrete measures taken. One of the factors that is certainly keeping women inactive in Kosovo is the Limited access to kindergartens. In Kosovo, the issue of childcare is a responsibility carried almost exclusively by women within households. For this practice to change, there is a need for a profound change of mindset. This would eliminate the cultural norms and biases, which imply that women are exclusively responsible for child and elderly care. There is a need to increase awareness about the fact that paying for child-care or elderly care services, by employing a custodian/kindergarten for certain hours, which corresponds with working hours, would only benefit the family financially in the long-run. This in turn will not only contribute to a women’s wellbeing, but will also generate more income for their family, allow women to find a job, or engage in other productive pursuits. Taking into consideration that Kosovo effectively lacks elderly care facilities, the entire burden of care in most cases falls onto women within the family.
Legislation

Current legal provisions for maternity leave have further deepened discrimination for women in the hiring process. This becomes especially difficult as most employers see maternal leave as a burden, which increases their costs and diminishes productivity. The major challenge lies especially in the private sector, as most employers simply try to avoid employing women who might be in the position of taking up maternity leave.\(^\text{10}\) Due to these provisions, there are numerous businesses that have started offering only monthly contracts to their workers.\(^\text{11}\)

The post-maternal leave professional life does also come with its share of struggles, as new mothers often have to deal with the fear of contract termination upon their return.\(^\text{12}\) There is no official data in regards to the percentage of contract termination for women. This is further proven by KWN’s report, “Striking a balance”, which analyzes the policy options indicate that employers may discriminate women with regard to the length of the contract signed, and this could be considered a symptomatic sign that employers are seeking to avoid responsibilities related to maternity leave\(^\text{13}\). Unfortunately, the extent of this phenomena is not easy measurable again due to the tendency of employers to satisfice. This pressure to go back to work adds on the already existing hardships related to childcare, like arranging nursery care and its cost. Furthermore, it has been noted that, for those women who successfully return to their jobs, promotion becomes even harder.\(^\text{14}\)

Although, Kosovo ranks first among the Balkan countries that provide the longest period for maternity leave (compared to Albania, Croatia, Montenegro, and Serbia), the level of compensation puts it to the bottom of this group.\(^\text{15}\)
Women’s inactivity in the labor market

Personal and/or family obligations force women to work part-time

Figure 1: The reasons of part-time employment by gender (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Child-care / adult-care with disabilities</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invalid or illness</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other personal reasons or family obligations</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>59.3%</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is a student</td>
<td>9.8%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not able to find a full-time job</td>
<td>83.9%</td>
<td>26.0%</td>
<td>63.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doesn't want a full-time job</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other reason</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Taking into consideration the enormously large number of inactive women in the labor market, it is very important to promote ways that encourage them, as to motivate them to be more proactive and become actively engaged in economic life. Part-time work could be used as a stepping-stone into full-time employment, particularly for women who have never worked before. As for the latest information, obtained through Kosovo’s Statistics Agency, measured through the Survey of the Work force, for the first three months of 2017, in Kosovo only 6.6% of the workforce hold part-time jobs. Women are more likely to get a part-time job (11%) compared to men (5.3%), while the main reason being so is due to women’s care responsibilities within the household (59.3%). Men feel that not being able to find a full-time job (83.9%) is what causes them to work part-time.

A recent report shows that women are more likely to work part-time than men. In this regard, in order to activate half of the inactive female population into Kosovo’s labor
market, the government could offer various schemes to promote part-time work, as an effort to actively involve women in the workforce. This will not only increase women’s welfare, but it will also help them to remain active in the labor market.
Survey Results: Why are women not participating in the labor market?

Women’s participation in the labor market is a crucial element in understanding the nature and success of a country’s development trajectory. As such in Kosovo, women represent an underutilized resource, while the reasons behind their inactivity can be attributed to a complex set of features, and their various political, economic and social dimensions. These elements have been carefully incorporated into the analysis of this research, in order to understand the barriers and factors shaping women’s participation in the formal labor market in Kosovo.

Lower educational level leads to more inactivity amongst women. The survey shows that 95% of women respondents who have obtained primary education or less have not searched for a job in the last three years. This result suggests that there is a proportional relationship between the level of a women’s educational attainment and her activity in the labor market.

D4D, through two surveys conducted with the Omnibus survey, aimed to find reasons behind women’s inactivity in the labor market. Each of the results is presented in its own chapter below.
Public vs private sector: Which one is more appealing?

The majority of the respondents (84%) have not applied for a job in the last three years. From the 16% that have applied, the private sector is more favorable when applying as 68% have applied in the private sector, and 32% in the public sector.

The chart below uses the data for applications and shows that those that applied for a job in the last three years, 10.1% have applied for vacancies in the public sector, and 21.5% in the private sector.

Figure 2: Have you applied for a job in the last three years? (public & private sector)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Private</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>![Government Building]</td>
<td>![Retail Store]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89.9%</td>
<td>78.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disaggregation by gender and age

Analyzing the data based on gender and age, the results show women respondents between 25-34 have the highest percentage of applications in both the private and public sector.
Figure 3: Have you applied for a job in the last three years? (age differences: private and public sector)

Disaggregation by educational level

Of the respondents who have applied for a job in the public sector in the last three years, the majority are bachelor graduates (38.3%), whilst those that have applied in the private sector half of them hold master degrees (50%). These data show that the higher the educational level the more are women prone to apply in the private sector rather than the public one.

Respondents under the category “Housewife” showed highest inactivity rate among the range of categories, with only 1% of women who have been searching for a job in the last three years.

Disaggregation by income

When analyzing from their level of income, most respondents (12.7%) that have applied for a job either in the public or private sector have a family income of 301-450 €. Respondents with a family income of 151-300 € hold the
least percentage (1.5%) that have applied for a job in the last three years.

**Figure 4: Have you applied for a job in the last three years? (based on family income)**

Data shows that respondents that have applied in a vacancy in the public sector come mostly from the region of Gjilan (19.7%), Prishtina (15%), and Mitrovica (9.1%). From those that have applied in the private sector, Gjilan still stands as the first with 35.7%, whilst the second one is Peja with 30.0%, and Prishtina with 27.6%. The two graphs below present these data. The data do not equal 100%, as we only looked at the respondents who have applied in either private or public sector.

**Disaggregation by region**
Figure 5: The percentage of women who applied in public sector (by regions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gjilan</td>
<td>19.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peja</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prishtina</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prizren</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferizaj</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gjakova</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 6: The percentage of women who applied in private sector (by regions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gjilan</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peja</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prishtina</td>
<td>27.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prizren</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferizaj</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gjakova</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Family responsibilities hinder women to search for jobs

Data from the survey shows that taking care of children and elderly in the family (53.2%) is the main reason why the respondents feel that women are in-active in the labor market. Lack of job opportunities for women (46.8%), and respondents believing that women are less likely to get employed in comparison to men (30.1%) are the other two main reasons identified by the respondents. Only 21% of the respondents think that due to the lack of matching education with labor demand is the reason why women are inactive.

Figure 7: Which do you think are the main reasons that women are not looking for a job?

- Take care for their children and elderly in the family: 53.2%
- There are no jobs available: 46.8%
- Women are less likely to get employed compared to men: 30.1%
- Educated in fields/profiles where the labor demand is low: 21.0%

53.2% of the responders think that women do not search for a job because they take care for their children and elderly in the family.

Random sample with 1070 respondents and stratified according to ethnicities: Albanian, Serbian and other non-majority ethnicities. From 1070 respondents, 46.9% were men and 53.1% were women.
Disaggregation by ethnicity and age

While for 53.8% of Kosovo Albanians, taking care of children and elderly in a family was ranked as the main reason behind women’s inactivity in the labor market, 42% of Kosovo Serbs selected the option “there are no jobs available” as the main reason. This same reason was mostly selected by the respondents of other ethnic groups who took part in this research.

Taking age as a reference, 60.2% of the respondents, who fall under the age group between 25-34 years old, think that taking care of children and elderly is the main reason why women are not active in the labor market. Respondents with few years of high school education share the same opinion with 66.1%.

Over 60% of the respondents (men and women) from the category of inactive, think that women do not search for a job because they are taking care of children and the elderly in their families.
Is discrimination impeding women’s inclusion in the labor market?

Discriminations hinders both women’s inclusion in the labor market, and also women’s development in the workplace. More than half of the respondents (59.8%) feel that women are discriminated throughout the hiring process.

**Figure 8: Discrimination against women in the hiring process**

![Pie chart showing 40.2% NO and 59.8% YES]

**Disaggregation by age and educational level**

Respondents between 25-44 years old were more likely to think that women are discriminated in the hiring process, with over 65% of the respondents answering positively, in comparison to other age groups. Roughly, the same percentage of respondents with lower education level share this opinion (64.9%) compared to respondents with more advanced level of education.

**Disaggregation by ethnicity**

There is only a slight difference between men and women in this regard. However, there are significant differences among ethnicities. While 60.7% of Kosovo Albanian respondents think that there is discrimination against women in the hiring process, and only 35.3% of Kosovo Serb
respondents agree that women are discriminated.

**Disaggregation by employment status**

Analyzing data based on the employment status we see that most of the respondents that think that women are discriminated in the workplace are inactive (76.2%) and the least of the respondents (52.1%) that agree that women are discriminated, are retired.

**Figure 9: Rate of women that think there is discrimination in the hiring process**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment Status</th>
<th>Rate of Discrimination (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Housewife</td>
<td>64.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>52.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed occasionally</td>
<td>74.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed looking for a job</td>
<td>54.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not looking for a job</td>
<td>76.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed in private sector</td>
<td>55.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed in public sector</td>
<td>62.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discrimination is affected by societal and cultural norms.

Respondents who believe there is gender discrimination in the employment process of women believe the main sources are the patriarchal society (43%), maternity leave (26%), and the perceived belief that women have less connections than men (21%).

The data only confirms similar data acquired from other studies, that echoes the idea that the discrimination process against women in the labor force is primarily affected by the pre-determined roles that are given to women in the patriarchal society; and issues with maternity leave whose dispositions have paved the way for discrimination, not only throughout the work, but particularly in the hiring process. The discrimination derived from the provisions of the maternity leave are more evident in the private sector.

In order to ensure a representative sample, 1,070 people were surveyed, stratified by ethnicity: albanians, serbs, and non-serb minorities. From 1,070 surveyed, 46.9% are men, and 53.1% are women.
Equal treatment in the workplace would motivate women to be active in the labor market

The findings suggest that equal treatment for women and men in the workplace is the most incentivizing factor for women to become active in the labor market, as 32.2% of the respondents believe that is the case.

Other factors that the respondents feel would contribute to increasing women’s activity in the labor market are equal pay for equal opportunities (25.4%), part-time job/flexible work hours (16.6%), and access to childcare centers (14.2%).

Figure 11: What are the factors that would motivate and enable women to become active in the labor market?

Disaggregation by age

It is interesting to note that a high number of respondents (75.9%) between the ages of 18-24 thought that equal
treatment and equal pay would motivate women to be active in the labor market.

These data confirm that it is the young generation that feel that equal treatment and responsibilities should be set as common value in the labor market and in society as a whole.

Disaggregation by ethnicity and employment status

There are also differences among ethnicities in this regard. While Kosovo Albanian respondents ranked first equal treatment of women and men (70.9%) as a motivating factor for women to look for a job, Kosovo Serbs respondents thought that equal pay and responsibility (63.3%) is the most important factor in this matter. Furthermore, a considerable number of respondents (75.4%) who are not looking for a job, think that equal treatment of men and women is the main factor that would motivate women to start looking for a job.
Access to affordable childcare and elderly care facilities contributes to women’s increase in active labor

When respondents were asked if given the chance to have someone else take care of their children and/or elderly, 24.5% claimed that this would incentivize them to become active in the labor market. However, some answers are alarming, as 15.0% stated that they would not do that as they do not feel the need to work, and 11.6% claimed no, as they feel that they should be the ones to look after children and/or elderly.

Figure 12: If you could send your children in a kindergarten and if someone else would take care of the elderly, would you start working tomorrow?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I don’t know</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irrelevant question to me (I don’t have to take care of anyone in the family)</td>
<td>33.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No (I’m not interested to work)</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No (I am the only responsible for taking care of children and elderly)</td>
<td>11.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disaggregation by educational level

The higher their education level the more prone are the respondents to confirm that if given the opportunity to have
someone else take care of their children and/or elderly they would start work tomorrow. The biggest distribution lies with those that hold master degrees as 58.3% agree with the previous statement.
Women lack access to tailored job-trainings

In order to support women to activate themselves in the labor market, it would be helpful to offer them tailored training programs which would enhance their job-related skills. In this survey, a staggering 76.2% say that they have never received this type of training.

Figure 13: Did you have access to job-related training's?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NO (I was not provided with any training)</td>
<td>76.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES (I have attended training's but didn't have any impact)</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES (As a result of these training's I have started to look for a job)</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disaggregation by education, employment status, income, and region

Respondents, who have only finished elementary school education or less and have never received any training programs is the highest percentage at 89.1%.

A large percentage of women respondents (95.5%) who are inactive in the labor market, have never received any job-related training program. Based on personal income, 84.5% of respondents who earned less than 150 euros per month, have never received any training program. There is no significant ethnic difference in this regard, but there are differences among regions. Respondents from Gjakova (94.2%) and Prizren (82.9%) were less likely to attend any job-related training program.
Women are challenged by lack of job opportunities to undertake new responsibilities and be part of decision making in general

The data shows that amongst main factors that hinder women in taking new responsibilities and decision making are the lack of job opportunities (57.1%), followed with low level of education (31.5%) and the lack of proper trainings on finding jobs (30.3%).

Figure 14: Factors that challenge/hinder you to take a new job responsibilities
Findings from the workshops

Workshops allowed us to validate our findings, but also provide us with input in regards to data based on the regions. When presented our findings from the survey, the workshop participants confirmed that the cases identified stand.

The lack of employment opportunities, taking care for children and the elderly, the absence of capacity building efforts for women over 35 years old, as well as the problem related to the diploma nostrification processes for the Kosovo Serb women, are some of the key issues noted by the participants.
The benefits to the society deriving from active women in the labor market

The alarming rate of over 80% of inactivity amongst women is very damaging economically to the country, as the maximum production function of society is impossible to be achieved. An underperforming economy, a lower rate of GDP per capita is damaging to all members of society and has to be addressed in order to achieve a sustainable overall development of the country.

To develop fully, Kosovo must tap into its unused resources, as World Bank’s country report asserts: “Refocusing Kosovo’s growth agenda requires retaining its economic foundations while increasingly tapping into production factors – natural and human resources—that are either chronically underused or not used at all.”

These “chronically underused/not used at all resources” unfortunately comprise an incredibly large portion of women in society and is limiting the progress of the economy, but with it as an indirect consequence - also a reduced rate of international integration. Addressing gender inequality is the first step in understanding its impact in the women’s inactivity in the labor market. As is stated in the World Bank – Gender Equality and Development report: “Gender equality is a core development objective in its own right. It is also smart economics. Greater gender equality can enhance productivity, improve development outcomes for the next generation, and make institutions more representative.”
Some of the main benefits of activating women as active members in the economy are:

- Improved policy decisions, democracy and more representative institutions will be possible by giving women a voice and empowerment in formal labor market. \(^{21}\)
- Avoid sociological repercussions of being unemployed and being inactive that can be caused to women.
- Decreased rigidity of the patriarchal system and with it the vicious cycle affecting women which has consequences for them in terms of having status issues.
- Increase in overall income for society by more work being done in the country, more wealth, more services and products made.
- Bringing more women into the labor force can significantly boost income per capita and GDP growth.\(^{22}\)

Activating women in the economy will have a direct impact on economic growth. The estimated GDP increase would roughly be of at least 30%, by employing half of the roughly 200,000 inactive women in the labor market.\(^{23}\)

- An increase in economic development is related to lower gender stereotypes especially by improving the socio-economic position of women within a family and society.
- Better economic development, by involving and empowering women, means a higher political engagement of women in decision making processes.
- Children will have a higher human development index and achieve greater human capital, which can benefit the economic development of a country if women have more say and control over the household, especially if they have control over financial resources.\(^{24}\)
Recommendations

For the Government:

Review the current Labor Law and regulations. Review the current regulations and suggest possible amendments to enable and ease the creation of flexible working hours and higher considerations for the specifics of gender in the workplace;

Provide education and re-training schemes for women who are long-term unemployed. Education is of paramount importance in order to enable the inclusion of women in the labor market. Education sessions, particularly focused on training women on new skills, would give inactive women a renewed chance and motivation to be active in or return to the labor market. It would as well enrich them with valuable new skills that would in turn give optimism and confidence to them, particularly that sustainable employment is possible through their own active engagement;

Encourage flexible working hours for women who are long term unemployed. Increase labor market flexibility by supporting the creation and promotion of jobs with flexible work schedules, which in turn allows and encourages women who are currently outside the labor market to be reintroduced as active participants in the labor market;

Introduce good practice in the division of employment services for women. Analyze international programs, experiences and best practices, which apply flexible work systems, and identify the ones that are appropriate to incorporate into Kosovo’s labor market. It involves understanding and responding to women’s specific, cultural and socio-economic circumstances, and adopting a strategic and gender-
sensitive approach in providing increased employment opportunities for women;

**Provide better childcare.** The lack of quality childcare services, access to them, but also factors of affordability, are often an obstacle for women to be engaged actively in the labor market. Therefore, improved childcare services, in terms not just of quality, but also cost and accessibility, would enable mothers to spend less time on childcare and serves as an incentive to actively participate in the labor market;

**Increase the number of elderly care facilities and improve the existing ones.** The restoration of existing facilities and the creation of new ones would remove the women's burden of care for the elderly people, thus allowing women to seek for employment opportunities.

**Provide more market-focused job training.** Employment training should be developed with an eye on the needs of the market and specifically focus on skills that employers need or see as a trend in the future. This would enable training and work experience provisions matching up with the available job opportunities, or those to be created in the near future;

**Promote job-start programs, support women entrepreneurship and press for larger labor-conducive market policies.** These policies should support and encourage women entrepreneurship – particularly self-employment schemes, be it in services, agriculture, trade etc., which in turn would allow flexible work schedules and possibly also enable women to participate in the labor market through part-time work; Enable a better working environment for those who are active in the labor market.

**Encourage growth of women-owned businesses.** Improve and amend the existing labor environment and
formulate various administrative and financial incentives for women to start their own businesses. These mechanisms could be for example: reduced taxes, the use of a quota mechanism for subsidies and grants, reduced bureaucratic burden, or even the provision of crucial infrastructure (equipment/hardware, software, consultancy etc.), for their businesses to be working well, especially at the start-up phase. Another form could be the provision of a communication and linkage mechanism/organization between these women-owned businesses with outside donors, who implement gender-oriented projects.

**For Civil Society**

**National, local NGOs as well as INGOs, could further support women.** These organizations could help women by building capacities regarding soft skills such as interview techniques, guidance on completing application forms and job seeking procedures, and provide help in writing resumes. They can also assist women by providing constructive advice, link them with business consultancies, which in turn could help entrepreneurial women with establishing better connections to the market for their services and goods that they produce.

On a more personal level, offer experiential/career planning, and help in achieving long-term career goals that match those of the overall labor market goals. Another important role is that of exposing any case of discrimination against women in the workplace, and producing materials which could inform the broader public of the difficulties women face in the workplace and elsewhere.

**Provide positive examples through women role-models and entrepreneurs.** Examples of successful women entrepreneurs and women who have both a balanced work and family life, are very important as they
can be a very good example, be an inspiration and provide encouragement for other women to follow;

**Develop an active media campaign.** This campaign should have as its primary working objective the increase of awareness towards the important role of women in the market, why it matters so much and the benefits for society from women being active in the economic sphere. But also inform people of the great importance of the concept of flexible work and its importance on economic and social development.
Annex 1: Key LF definitions

1. The labor force comprises those who are employed and those who are unemployed, according to the strict definitions given below. Inactive persons are not considered part of the labor force.

1.1 Employed: People aged 15-64 years who during the reference week performed some work for wage or salary, or profit or family gain, in cash or in kind or were temporarily absent from their jobs.

1.2 Unemployed: People aged 15-64 years who during the reference week were: without work, that is, were not in paid employment or self-employment; and currently available for work, that is, were available for paid employment or self-employment within two weeks; and seeking work, that is, had taken specific steps in the previous four weeks to seek paid employment or self-employment.

2. Inactive: People aged 15-64 who were neither employed nor unemployed during the reference period. It is the proportion of a country’s working-age population that is neither employed nor unemployed. When added together, the inactivity rate and the labor force participation rate sum to 100 per cent.

2.1 Discouraged workers are people without work who are currently available for work but who have given up looking for work because they believe that they cannot find work. They are included within the inactive category.

3. The employment-to-population ratio, also known as the employment rate, is the proportion of a country’s working-age population that is employed.

4. The unemployment rate is the proportion of the labor force that is not employed. It is the labor force that serves as the base for this indicator, not the working-age population.
List of Publications

Elections & Political Parties


#2 D4D Institute. March 2012. An Impression of Reform: How to Restore Trust on Elections?


#5 Malazogu, Leon and Selatin Kllokoqi. September 2013. Translation of Trust Perception of Representation and Participation.

#6 Malazogu, Leon and Selatin Kllokoqi. September 2013. Electoral Deform: Two years later, reform is back to square zero

#7 Leon Malazogu and Brenna Gautam; With contribution by Rezarta Delibashzade & Ngadhnjim Halilaj. 26 November 2014. Kosovo’s Political Compass – Mapping Party Ideology

#8 Dardan Berisha with contribution by Driton Qeriqi, Mjellma Hapçi-Alijaj & Rina Vokshi, July 2015. Bringing Justice to Elections


#10 Thomas Atherton, Driton Qeriqi and Rina Vokshi, February 2016 Manual for Gender Equality in the Electoral Process
Women’s inactivity in the labor market

---

**Forum Reforma Recommendations**

#1 D4D Institute. 29 November 2011. Structure of the CEC

#2 Compiled by D4D Institute. 17 January 2011. The Electoral System

#3 Compiled by D4D Institute. 29 November 2011. Repairing the voters list

#5 Compiled by D4D Institute. 12 December 2011. Recommendations for Electing the President of Kosovo

#6 Supported by: D4D, KIPRED, INPO, KMDLNJ, INDEP, DT, KHK, QPA, and NOMP. For Genuine Election Reform

---

**Ethnic Relations**


#5 Malazogu, Leon and Alex Grigorev. September 2012. From Creative Ambiguity to a Constructive Process: How to Approach Northern Kosovo? PER-K/D4D Institute


Public Interest


#2 Gashi, Drilon and Shoghi Emerson. May 2013. A Class of Its Own: Patronage and its impact on Social Mobility in Kosovo

#3 Sutaj, Visar and Leon Malazogu. January 2013. Let the Real Civil Society Please Stand Up! The Role of Membership Associations in Shaping Decision-Making to Serve the Public Interest


#5 Ardiana Gashi and Artane Rizvanoll; With contributions by Natalya Wallin, Rezarta Delibashzade and Ngadhnjim Halilaj. 25 February 2015. The Cost of Patriarchy.

#6 Rezarta Delibashzade, Laura Flemming, Ramadan Klisurica, Agon Maliqi and Rina Abazi. The Role of Interest Groups: Best Practices, Case Studies, and Lessons Learned

#7 Dukagjin Pupovci & Gersi Gashi. November, 2015 Reforming the University of Prishtina - Mission Possible?

#8 Leon Malazogu and Bernard Nikaj; with contribution by Gulliver Brady. November, 2016. Incentives for Accountability and Performance in Higher Education

#9 Jehona Serhati; with editing contribution by Abby Riley. January, 2017. Incentives4Reform: Increasing opportunities for VET students and graduates in the labour market

#11 Visar Sutaj, October 2017. How Independent are Regulatory Authorities in Kosovo?

**Reaction Memos**

#1 D4D Institute. November 2012. Reaction memorandum no. 1 – Police Overreaction

#2 D4D Institute. December 2012. Reaction memorandum no. 2 – The two Germanies model

#3 D4D Institute. 12 July 103. Reaction memorandum no. 3 – Set Criteria for New Municipalities

#4 D4D Institute & Qëndrim Gashi. January 2013. Reaction memorandum no. 4 – University of Prishtina in a vicious circle

#5 D4D Institute & Kushtrim Palushi. January 2013. Reaction memorandum no. 5 – Electoral reform

#6 D4D Institute. November 2016. Action memorandum no. 6 – Electoral Reform

**Indicators & Scenarios**


#2 D4D Institute. State of the State: Performance Based Indicators.

#3 Malazogu, Leon. November 2013. Agreement in None, Including Its Name: Kicking the Can Will No Longer Bring the Sides Closer Around the Association / Community

#4 N/A

**Other Publications**

#1 The series of endorsements and recommendations can also be found on our web-site.
Endnote

4 An omnibus survey is a method of quantitative marketing research where data on a wide variety of subjects is collected during the same interview. Retrieved from: https://www.surveyanalytics.com/omnibus-survey-definition.html
https://www.womensnetwork.org/documents/20160504154201373.pdf
14 Impact of the Labor Law on Women in Kosovo, p. 68, Kosovar Center for Gender Studies, 2011. 
http://www.womensnetwork.org/documents/20130530154116339.pdf, p. 68
16 Impact of the Labor Law on Women in Kosovo, p. 68, Kosovar Center for Gender Studies, 2011. 
18 Female Labor Force Participation in Developing Countries, Verick S., IZA World of Labor, September 2014, p.3, 
Women's inactivity in the labor market: factors hindering women's participation in the labor market / paper prepared by Linda Abazi Morina, Rezarta Delibashzade. – Prishtinë: Demokracia për Zhvillim. – 42 f. : illustr. ; 21 cm.

1. Morina Abazi, Linda 2. Delibashzade, Rezarta

The Democracy for Development (D4D) Institute was established in April 2010 by a group of analysts who were increasingly worried that the state-building exercise had neglected democracy. D4D’s mission is to influence the development of public policy in order to accelerate socio-economic development, improve governance, and strengthen democratic culture in Kosovo.

D4D’s vision is to promote an active and educated citizenry that both fully participates in the public space and utilises the public arena of representation and decision-making to deliberate and build consensus over smart, efficient, and sustainable resource allocation as well as equitable development.

For more information about D4D's activities please visit our website: www.d4d-ks.org.